

OCT 2 1931

The Classical Weekly

Published on Monday, October 1 to May 31, except in weeks in which there is a legal or School holiday (Election Day, Thanksgiving Day, Christmas Day, New Year's Day, Lincoln's Birthday, Washington's Birthday, Easter Sunday, Decoration Day). Place of Publication, Barnard College, New York City. In the United States of America, \$2.00 per volume; elsewhere \$2.50. Single numbers, 15 cents each. Address all communications to Charles Knapp, at 1737 Sedgwick Avenue, New York City. Entered as second-class matter, November 18, 1907, at the Post Office, New York, N. Y., under the Act of Congress of March 3, 1879. Acceptance for mailing at special rate provided for in Section 1103, Act of October 3, 1917, authorized June 28, 1918.

VOLUME XXV, No. 4

MONDAY, OCTOBER 26, 1931

WHOLE NO. 667

INCREASE SCHOLARSHIP



HEIGHTEN INTEREST

this year by using the

MACMILLAN CLASSICAL SERIES

General Editor, B. L. ULLMAN
Professor of Latin, University of Chicago

The unified series, recognized everywhere as standard. Meets all modern requirements in the study of Latin, including the recommendations of the Classical Investigation

The Series

ELEMENTARY LATIN—By B. L. Ullman and N. E. Henry	
Includes a study of the subjunctive	\$1.40
NEW ELEMENTARY LATIN—By B. L. Ullman and N. E. Henry	
For classes preferring to postpone the subjunctive to the second year	\$1.40
SECOND LATIN BOOK—By B. L. Ullman and N. E. Henry	
REVISED	\$1.68
THIRD LATIN BOOK—By B. L. Ullman, N. E. Henry, and D. S. White	\$2.20
PROGRESS TESTS IN LATIN—B. L. Ullman and A. W. Smalley	\$.60
EASY LATIN PLAYS—By Lillian B. Lawler	\$.80

Forthcoming:

ROME AND THE ROMANS. By GRANT SHOWERMAN

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

New York

Boston

Chicago

Dallas

Atlanta

San Francisco

IN THE LIMAX SERIES

LATIN—FIRST YEAR (Magoffin and Henry) and LATIN—SECOND YEAR (Berry and Lee) unite to give the student that good start which is more than half the race in High School Latin.

These two books have established the superlative educational value of *Lesson Unity*. Everything is based on the Latin reading—forms, syntax, comprehension, required vocabulary, and word study.

Prepared by different authors but under the same editorship, the books form a two-year course which is closely knit yet varied.

Silver, Burdett and Company

New York

Newark

Boston

Chicago

San Francisco



IMPORTANT FACTS

about

Place's First Year Latin

It is in accord with the suggestions for first year work given in the Report of the Classical Investigation

It contains 105 lessons and also numerous easy Latin Readings, a succinct, impressive Historical Introduction, brief accounts of Roman life and customs, and well-planned Reviews

It presents each new inflection with single emphasis

It provides constant correlation of Latin and English and "project exercises" which enliven the pupil's work

It makes the study of Latin seem alive and important through its Latin Readings with their wide range of human interest and through its presentation of "Related English Words" in each vocabulary

It makes special provision for the mastery of the "working vocabulary"

First Year Latin \$1.32

Intermediate Latin Lessons \$0.40

First Year Latin Enlarged (Including Intermediate Latin Lessons) \$1.40

AMERICAN BOOK COMPANY

New York

Cincinnati

Chicago

Boston

Atlanta

The Classical Weekly

VOLUME XXV, No. 4

MONDAY, OCTOBER 26, 1931

WHOLE No. 667

GADARENES IN PAGAN LITERATURE¹

When streams of culture emanating from diverse sources have mingled, the resultant blend has frequently had peculiar significance in the history of civilization. The Etruscans in Rome, the Normans in England, the melting-pot in America provide examples. The principal claim on our attention which the Hellenistic Age possesses is that in that age cultures hitherto disparate combined to form the basis for modern European civilization. The Hellenism which Rome learned and preserved for future ages was not the Hellenism of fifth-century Athens, but the Hellenism of the later, though not necessarily decadent², Hellenistic Age. In the Hellenistic Age Greek life and letters penetrated into the remote regions of the Near East, and more or less strongly colored the civilization of the regions into which they penetrated. But cultural influence traveled in both directions: Greek life and letters not only acted upon the Oriental way of life, but were themselves acted upon, though, to be sure, in less degree, by the Oriental way of life. Of the Semitic peoples that inhabited the eastern end of the Hellenistic world a certain emotional intensity has been characteristic. Sometimes this intensity has expressed itself in spiritual exaltation, as in the Book of Amos, sometimes in sensuous love poetry, as in the Book of Canticles. In the blending of cultures we should expect the easterners to contribute something of these qualities. It would be interesting to notice any specific instances of such contributions.

That the Greek spirit pervaded Syria and Palestine requires no proof. Syria welcomed Hellenization readily, even enthusiastically³. Even the Old Testament bears traces of Greek influence. The author of the Book of Job, it seems to me, must have known the Prometheus of Aeschylus: nowhere else in Oriental literature does a mortal dare upbraid a god who seems to be acting the tyrant⁴. It seems clear, too, that the author of Ecclesiastes was familiar with the Hellenistic philosophies⁵. But what of influence in the other

direction? We hear a good deal of the dissolute, profligate, untrustworthy Syrian⁶. Syria, according to Ferrero⁷,

showed no capacity for policy, war, philosophy, or high art, and was attracted only by wealth and pleasure.... The majority of the male and female musicians scattered throughout the empire were Syrian; Syrian also were a large number of the courtesans established at Rome....

Everyone remembers Juvenal's sentiments on the subject⁸. I have suggested elsewhere⁹ that Petronius has Syrians in mind when he portrays the upstarts at Trimalchio's dinner. But one need go no further than Cicero¹⁰ to find expression of the conservative Roman's attitude toward Syrians, namely, that they were a race born for servitude, though Cicero himself could make an exception in the case of the poet Archias, who was a Syrian, born at Antioch.

That is the debit side of the ledger. There is a credit side. It will be agreed, I think, that the Stoic philosophy is the most worthwhile contribution of the Hellenistic Age to human thought. Perhaps it is more than a coincidence that the principal representatives of the Stoa were Semites¹¹. There is significance in the fact that Tarsus was the place of origin of four famous Stoic teachers, Antipater and Archedemus, Heraclides and Athenodorus. To his contemporaries Zeno himself was certainly a Semite¹². For the character of Zeno's teaching let me quote a few suggestive lines from Edwyn Bevan¹³:

... The prophet and philosopher speak in quite different tones of voice. Now the curious thing about Zeno, it seems to me, is that while his message was Hellenic, his tone of voice was that of the prophet. He had something positive to say, something he wished men to believe, and he conformed to the Hellenic requirements.... He named Reason, yes: but in what manner? One might perhaps express the singular

literature on the subject, in a section entitled *The Relation of 'Ooheleth' to Greek Thought*. Professor Barton is inclined to minimize the Greek influence.

¹E. S. Bouchier, *Syria as a Roman Province*, 1-19 (Oxford, Blackwell, 1916), describes the peoples and the natural characteristics of Syria. On page 9, note 1, he quotes from Greco-Roman authors several unfavorable opinions of Syrians.

²G. Ferrero, *Greatness and Decline of Rome*, 5.35-37 (in the English translation by H. J. Chaytor, New York, G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1909).

³Compare Juvenal 3.62-65:

iam pridem Syrus in Tiberim defluxit Orontes
et linguam et mores et cum tibicine chordas
obliquas nec non gentilia tympana secum
vexit et ad circum iussas prostare puellas.

⁴Oriental Elements in Petronius, *The American Journal of Philology* 50 (1929), 378-385.

⁵De Provinciis Consularibus 10: ... Iudaeis et Syris, nationibus natis servituti.

⁶See Paul Wendland, *Die Hellenistisch-Römische Kultur in ihren Beziehung zu Judentum und Christentum*, 41 (Tübingen, I. C. B. Mohr, 1912): "Die Mehrzahl der älteren Stoiker stammt aus dem Osten, aus einem Gebiete der Völker- und Kultur Mischung". Compare also Theodor Hoffner, *Orient und Griechische Philosophie* (Beiheft zum *Alten Orient*, 1925, Heft 4). On pages 64-82 Hoffner deals with the penetration of Oriental elements, chiefly mystical, into Greek philosophy.

⁷This is shown by W. W. Tarn, *Hellenistic Civilization*, 295, and note (London, Arnold, 1930).

⁸Stoics and Sceptics, 22 (Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1913).

¹This paper was read at the Twenty-fourth Annual Meeting of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States, held at Lehigh University, Bethlehem, Pennsylvania, May 1-2, 1931.

²So, for example, Professor M. Rostovtzeff, *A History of the Ancient World*, 1.379 (Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1926), says: "First of all we must altogether discard the once fashionable notion, that this was a decadent civilization. We shall see later that the facts lend no support to this theory. The Greek genius was just as creative as it had been in earlier times; and it still shaped forth treasures not less precious than those of the fifth and fourth centuries B. C."

³For example, J. P. Mahaffy, *The Progress of Hellenism in Alexander's Empire*, 97 (The University of Chicago Press, 1905), says: "But as regards Syria itself, Coele-Syria, and northern Palestine, we may safely assert that no outlying country in Alexander's empire was ever so thoroughly Hellenized."

⁴See, for example, Nathaniel Schmidt, *The Messages of the Poets*, 76-77 (Volume 7 of *The Messages of the Bible*, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1909). Professor Schmidt suggests that the author of the Book of Job was acquainted with Plato as well as with Aeschylus.

⁵G. A. Barton, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Book of Ecclesiastes*, 32-43 (The International Critical Commentary, New York, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1908), discusses the

combination of manner and matter in his message by saying that its burden was 'Thus saith Reason'. . . . German 'Quellenkritiker' tell us that the lost works of Posidonius were the source for most of the philosophy, the history, and the science of the Greco-Roman world¹⁴. Posidonius was born at Apameia, in Syria. The mysticism of Vergil, not only in the so-called Messianic Eclogue, but also in many parts of the Aeneid, may well have been inspired by Oriental sources¹⁵. Above all, Christianity itself, as Professor W. S. Ferguson has said¹⁶, was formed in "the milieu in which heretical Judaism was fused with cosmopolitanized Hellenism. . . ."

It is my purpose here to remark briefly on the work and influence of only three authors from a single town a little to the east of the Jordan, near the southern shore of the lake of Tiberias. These three authors exerted considerable influence on Greco-Roman literature, and thus illustrate the quality and the quantity of the Oriental element in Greco-Roman civilization. Gadara¹⁷, modern Umm Keis, was a flourishing city of the Decapolis, with characteristic Hellenistic culture. Part of a description of the ruins of the town runs thus¹⁸:

... The ruins of *Umm Keis* contain the remains of a very handsome and extensive city, with buildings of great magnificence. . . . There are to be seen among the ruins two large <Greek> theatres, a basilica, a temple, the main street running east and west, with colonnades, the columns lying just as they fell, and many large private buildings, the whole surrounded by a city wall with gates. . . . The eastern theatre is in an almost perfect state of preservation; the approach to it would have been extremely grand, passing from the main street over a great platform surrounded by columns. . . .

Gadara is commonly identified with Ramoth Gilead of the Bible. It was a fortified city when Antiochus the Great took it in 218 B. C. The Jewish king Alexander Jannaeus took it, after a siege lasting ten months, about 100 B. C. It was 'freed' by Pompey the Great in 63, and from that date it counted its era, as the numerous coins show. In 30 B. C. Octavian gave the city to Herod the Great. The Gadarenes complained of Herod's rule before Agrippa at Mitylene, in 22 B. C., and before Augustus himself in Syria, in 20 B. C. After the death of Herod (4 B. C.) Gadara was an independent city under Rome¹⁹.

¹⁴For Posidonius see Wilhelm von Christ's *Geschichte der Griechischen Literatur*, Sechste Auflage. . . von Wilhelm Schmid, Zweiter Teil, Erste Hälfte, 347-355 (Munich, Beck, 1920). Hereinafter this work will be cited as Christ-Schmid. On page 347 Christ-Schmid says: "Mit einer seit Aristoteles nicht mehr dagesessenen, aber auch an Aristoteles stark genährten Universalität umspannte dieser geradezu alle wissenschaftliche Gebiete und stellte die ungeheure Masse seiner Einzelkenntnisse in den Dienst einer mystischen, teils platonisierenden, teils orientalisierenden Gesamtaufassung, die der Zeitstimmung offenbar ganz gemäss war, und sich nun wie ein Lauffeuer über die ganze griechische und römische Litteratur verbreitet hat".

¹⁵See, for example, Norman W. DeWitt, *The Influence of the Saviour's Sentiment upon Virgil*, Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association 54 (1923), 39-50.

¹⁶In *The Cambridge Ancient History*, 7.2 (Cambridge: At the University Press, 1928).

¹⁷A full description of Gadara, with drawings and plans, is to be found in Gottlieb Schumacher, *Northern Ajlun*, 46-80 (London, Palestine Exploration Fund Publications, 1890). Compare Baedeker's *Palestine and Syria*, 161 (1912).

¹⁸Colonel Sir Charles Warren, in Hastings's *Dictionary of the Bible*, 2.79-80 (1901). Compare the article Gadara (unsigned), in *Encyclopaedia Biblica*, 2.1587-1588 (1901).

¹⁹The history of Gadara, with complete documentation, is given by E. Schürer, *Geschichte des Jüdischen Volkes in Zeitalter Jesu Christi*, 2^a 157-161 (Leipzig, J. C. Hinrichs, 1907).

Of the Gadarenes who are known to have influenced western literature the first in point of time, and probably in importance as well, is Menippus, who lived in the early part of the third century B. C. Menippus is a good example of the Syrian contribution to Greek literature at its best. His characteristics were keen humor, freedom from tradition in form and in matter, scornful mockery of the follies of human kind, especially when these follies were sanctioned by traditions of religion or philosophy, and, above all, the impulse to preach²⁰. In spirit and in method, if not in form, Menippus would conform to the best type of English satirist. Marcus Aurelius²¹ classified Menippus with the 'mockers of man's perishable and transitory life itself'. The epithet applied to Menippus, *δσπουδογέλοιος*²², explains his character. In Menippus earnestness is mollified by humor and humor is dignified by earnestness, but the end aimed at is earnestness, and humor is only a means. The method is *ridendo dicere verum*. That there was a moral purpose in the writings of the Cynics, of whom Menippus is the best known and most influential literary representative, is proven by the fact that ecclesiastical writers frequently imitated them²³. Geffcken²⁴ has shown that the Epistle of James 3.1-11 and Tertullian, *De Pallio* are Cynic-Stoic diatribes. Eduard Schwartz²⁵ suggests the same character for Clement of Alexandria's treatise, 'The Rich Man's Salvation', and there are undoubtedly many other examples in early Christian literature. The form was apparently introduced from pagan literature by Philo Judaeus, and from him taken over by Christian writers²⁶. 'Cynicism is a short cut to virtue', we read in Diogenes Laertius²⁷: *ἐλαί γὰρ τὸν κυνισμόν σύντομον ἐπ' ἀρετὴν ὁδόν*. In the *Protrepticus* of Clement²⁸ the sacred writings are the short cut to salvation: *γραφὰί δὲ αἱ θείαι . . . σύντομοι σωτηρίας ὁδοί*. So similar are the pagan and the Christian forms that Gilbert Murray²⁹ can speak of "the form of literature known to the Cynics as *χρῆλα*, 'a help', or *διατριβή*, 'a study', and by the Christians as *ὁμιλία*, a 'homily' or 'sermon'".

²⁰Compare A. and M. Croiset, *Histoire de la Littérature Grecque*, 5.48 (Paris, 1928): "Mais le mérite essentiel <of Menippus> en était une verve audacieuse et spirituelle, qui ne respectait rien". Christ-Schmid, 1.86, in reference to the school of the Cynics, of which Menippus was an outstanding literary exponent, speak of "ihre lebhafteste Kritik menschlicher Verkehrtheit aller Art. . . ihre rücksichtslose Verachtung aller Tradition. . . ihr Streben nach volkstümlichen, anschaulichen, mit Witz und Bildern gewürzten Darstellungsformen, um auf die Massen zu wirken, wie der Arzt auf den Kranken wirkt. . ."

²¹6.47: *αὐτῆς τῆς ἐπικλήρου καὶ ἐφημέρου τῶν ἀνθρώπων ζωῆς χλεύασται*.

²²Strabo 16.2.29 lists the famous Gadarenes as follows: *ἐκ δὲ τῶν Γαδάρων Φιλόδημος τε καὶ Μελέαργος ὁ Ἐπικούρειος καὶ Μένιππος ὁ σπουδογέλοιος καὶ Θεόδωρος ὁ καθ' ἡμᾶς ῥήτωρ*.

²³Paul Wendland, in the work cited in note 11, above, discusses, on pages 75-81, the diatribe, and its strong influence on Christian writers, on pages 91-96. Compare A. Harnack, *The Mission and Expansion of Christianity in the First Three Centuries*, 1.290, 292 (in the translation by James Moffatt, New York, Theological Translation Library, 1908).

²⁴J. Geffcken, *Kynika und Verwandtes*, 45-53, 58-138 (Heidelberg, Winter, 1909).

²⁵*ΤΙΣ Ο ΣΥΝΤΟΜΟΣ ΠΑΤΗΣΙΟΣ*, *Hermes* 38 (1903), 74-100, especially page 90. I am convinced that the *Protrepticus* has the same character.

²⁶Paul Wendland, *Philo und die Kynisch-Stoische Diatribe* (Beiträge zur Geschichte der Griechischen Religion, Berlin, Gaertner, 1895).

²⁷Diogenes Laertius 7.121.

²⁸66 (Potter); compare also 79 (Potter).

²⁹Five Stages of Greek Religion, 116 (New York, Columbia University Press, 1925).

But a better known and equally effective influence was that exerted by Menippus on Varro²⁹. On the surface it may seem absurd to speak of the influence of one author whose works are lost on another whose work is extant only in fragments³⁰. But Varro admitted his indebtedness freely by calling his satires Menippean³¹. In the amazing range of his titles, in his technique of indiscriminate intermingling of verse and prose, in the reformer's zeal which the titles of his *Saturae Menippeae* and the extant fragments of those *Saturae* indicate, Varro shows that he attempted and did much that Menippus had done, and on the model furnished by Menippus. Varro's influence on later Roman authors, in turn, was very great. So, for example, it has been suggested by Otto Weinreich³² that Horace's second book of *Sermones* was inspired by Menippus just as his first book was inspired by Lucilius. An interesting point is that Horace, *Sermones* 2.3 is twice as long as his next longest satire. Its subject is *ὅτι πᾶς ἀφρων μαινεται*. Varro's most popular Menippean satire, as shown by the frequency of the fragments, was his *Eumenides*, of which the subject was also *ὅτι πᾶς ἀφρων μαινεται*. Kiessling-Heinze³³ suggest that Horace, *Sermones* 2.5 was suggested by a satire of Menippus, and there are other points of contact between the two authors³⁴.

The influence of Seneca on succeeding thought has been very considerable³⁵. Seneca's philosophical writings are strongly colored by the Cynic-Stoic diatribe³⁶. Seneca's satire on the apotheosis of Claudian, commonly called the *Apocolocyntosis*, is generally considered a Menippean satire. It is certainly such in form, for it is a mixture of prose and verse. Professor Ball³⁷ shows its similarities to Varro, which, in his opinion, justify the assumption of a common source. He points out that, while Varro is good-natured, humorous, and a helpful preacher, Seneca is only bitter and denunciatory. Professor Ball thinks that the *Θεῶν Ἐκκλησία* of Lucian bears such strong resemblance to Seneca's satire that there is a likelihood

that Lucian drew from Seneca³⁸. But, as I shall shortly show, it has been proven that Lucian followed Menippus so closely that a much easier explanation of similarities is that Menippus was a common source for both Seneca and Lucian. This would, in fact, be additional proof of Seneca's dependence on Menippus, again, probably, through Varro.

Juvenal is another Latin author from whom it has been supposed³⁹, Lucian drew. But the fact that Menippus is the source for Lucian and that Menippus's Roman follower Varro was a man of such outstanding reputation and popularity may again indicate Menippus as the ultimate common source. Surely the moral earnestness which Juvenal has or professes to have is quite in the spirit of the Syrian preacher⁴⁰. Petronius follows the Menippean form in his mingling of prose and verse, in his parodies, and in his railing mockery⁴¹. But, if an author like Menippus exerted influence on Rome at all, that influence must have been greater than can be gauged by copies of his form or of isolated motives⁴². Menippus was a man of very definite outlook on life, and, if the Romans studied him at all, they must have learned more than the mere mingling of prose and verse.

Nor is Menippus's work entirely unknown. His fellow Syrian Lucian, who lived some four centuries after him, also displayed to a marked degree the national characteristic of incisive humor and impish mockery of the sainted among both gods and men⁴³. Lucian, however, is *γέλαιος* without being *σπουδαῖος*; therefore he was not so well thought of by the ecclesiastical writers. Now, Rudolf Helm⁴⁴ has demonstrated, so far as such a thing may be demonstrated, an amazingly close dependence of Lucian on Menippus. By comparing passages in Lucian with fragments of writers, chiefly Varro, who are known to have been influenced by Menippus, and by showing that the historical background of the Menippean dialogues of Lucian suited Menippus's age much better than Lucian's own, Helm is able to say with some assurance that certain dialogues must have been lifted by Lucian almost entire from Menippus. A striking bit of evidence is the fact that in this group of dialogues no single person is mentioned who lived after the time of Menip-

²⁹For Varro see M. Schanz-C. Hosius, *Geschichte der Römischen Literatur*, I, 555-578; on pages 556-561 there is a discussion of the *Saturae Menippeae*. Illuminating notes on the life of Varro are to be found in C. Cichorius, *Römische Studien*, 207-226 (Leipzig and Berlin, 1922). An excellent discussion of the Menippean Satires is that of Karl Mraz, in *Neue Jahrbücher für das Klassische Altertum* 33 (1914), 390-420.

³⁰The fragments of Varro may be found in Heraeus's sixth edition of F. Buecheler's *Petronii Saturae*, etc., 177-250 (Berlin, Weidmann, 1912).

³¹Aulus Gellius 2.18.7: "...Menippus... cuius libros in satiris aemulatus est, quas alii Cynicas, ipse <Varro> appellat Menippeas. In Academi a 1.8 Cicero makes Varro say: et tamen in illis veteribus nostris quae Menippum imitati, non interpretati, quadam hilaritate conspersimus.

³²In his article entitled *Zur Römischen Satire*, *Hermes* 51 (1916), 386-414, especially pages 413-414. This article is valuable as a résumé of literature on Roman satire.

³³In the introduction to the poem in their edition, Q. Horatius Flaccus *Satiren*, 241-243 (Berlin, Weidmann, 1910).

³⁴See M. Schanz, *Geschichte der Römischen Literatur*, Zweiter Teil, Erste Hälfte, 147 (Munich, Beck, 1911), for literature on the relation between Horace and Menippus.

³⁵See, for example, R. M. Gummere, *Seneca the Philosopher and his Modern Message*, 31-138 (Our Debt to Greece and Rome, Boston, Marshall Jones Company, now New York, Longmans, Green and Company, 1922). <On this book see THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 17, 62-64. C. K. >.

³⁶Paul Wendland, page 79 of the work cited in note 11, above, says: "Der Grundton und die hervorstechende Farbe der gesamten Schriftstellerei des Philosophen Seneca ist der Diatribenstil".

³⁷Allan P. Ball, *The Satire of Seneca on the Apotheosis of Claudian*, Commonly Called the *ΑΠΟΚΟΛΥΤΩΣΙΣ*, 60-63 (New York, Columbia University Press, 1902).

³⁸See pages 75-77 of the work cited in the preceding note.

³⁹The beginning of Lucian's *Timon* is like Juvenal 13.113-114. Another similarity is indicated in note 42, below. Compare Josef Mesk, *Lucians Nigrinus und Juvenal*, *Wiener Studien* 34 (1912), 373-382, 35 (1913), 1-33.

⁴⁰Wendland, on page 79 of the work cited in note 11, above, says: "Denn nach Form und Gehalt hängen auch die Satiren des Persius und des Juvenal auf engste mit der Diatribe zusammen".

⁴¹See A. Collignon, *Étude sur Petrone*, 21-26 (Paris, 1892). Of Petronius's parodies Collignon says (227): "C'était une des traditions de la Ménippée de pasticher des morceaux célèbres et d'imiter la manière des écrivains en vue". Compare Martin M. Rosenbluth, *Petron und die Menippische Satire*, pages 10-36 of his *Beiträge zur Quellenkunde von Petrons Satiren* (a Kiel Dissertation, Berlin, 1909).

⁴²An instance of such a motive is that in Lucian's *Πρὸς τὸν Ἀπαιδευτὸν καὶ Πολλὰ Βιβλία Ὀνομαζόμενον*, which is echoed by Horace, *Carmina* 1.29.13; Petronius 48; Seneca, *De Tranquillitate Animi* 9.1, *Epistulae* 27.6; Juvenal 2.4-7.

⁴³For Lucian see Christ-Schmid, 1.710-744.

⁴⁴Lucian and Menipp (Leipzig, Teubner, 1906). There is a full review of this book by W. Capelle in *Berliner Philologische Wochenschrift* 34 (1914), 260-276; see also Christ-Schmid, 1.723-728. The pieces of Lucian which are supposedly taken from Menippus are *Menippus seu Necymantea*, *Icaromenippus*, *Catapulus*, *Dialogi Mortuorum*, *Iuppiter Tragoedus*, *Deorum Concilium*, *Vitarum Auctio*.

pus; the persons mentioned were famous during the lifetime of Menippus. Helm takes as an indication that Menippus was Lucian's source the fact that Lucian so abruptly ceased writing Menippean satires; Helm assumes that Lucian had exhausted the supply of originals and had not sufficient genius to continue in the same vein without models. The scenes in heaven and in hell in particular are taken from Menippus. Lucian does not adapt entire pieces of Menippus into single pieces of his own, but practises the reverse of *contaminatio*, so to speak, by using a single satire of Menippus as a quarry for several of his own. An inscriptional epigram which seems to echo Lucian but antedates him has been used by Geffcken⁴⁵ to corroborate Helm's proof of Lucian's dependence on Menippus. Indeed, Lucian himself indicates his indebtedness to Menippus. In the *Bis Accusatus* 33 he makes Dialogue say of Menippus⁴⁶:

But the climax was reached when he <Lucian> unearthed a barking, snarling old Cynic, Menippus by name, and thrust *his* company upon me; a grim bulldog, if ever there was one; a treacherous brute that will snap at you while his tail is yet wagging.

Another point must be noticed. Both Menippus and Lucian are Syrians, and the Menippean satire as it is described to us is a thoroughly Oriental form. The dramatic dialogue embodying keen comments on men and things composed in artistic prose with occasional intermingling of passages in strict meter is a classic Arabic form known as the *Maqama*⁴⁷. The Menippean satire is as close to nothing else in extant literature that I am acquainted with. We have in Menippus, then, an example of the product resulting from the fusion of two cultures. Though the works of Menippus himself are lost, their influence was effective in later authors, and portions have attained a sort of immortality by being preserved in Lucian and have affected literature of succeeding ages through Lucian⁴⁸. But, when we speak of Lucian as the representative of Menippus, we must bear one qualification in mind. Menippus certainly had a more serious purpose than Lucian shows; on no other basis can we conceive of the eminently respectable Varro imitating him, or of the ecclesiastical writers recognizing in him Cynic excellence.

I infer, then, a contribution, however slight, by my first Gadarene to the moral tone of European civilization. For my second, Meleager of Gadara⁴⁹, I claim the introduction of a new motive into the literature of Europe, the motive of romantic love. The emergence

of this motive required just such a mingling of traditions as Meleager probably embodied in his own person. His father was a Syrian Greek and his formal education was Greek; we must remember the two Greek theaters of Gadara and its splendid basilica. But his mother was in all likelihood a native. Certainly he considered himself Syrian and defended himself as such⁵⁰, and he was surely familiar with the Syrian language, as, indeed, he himself implies⁵¹; Gilbert Murray⁵² goes so far as to think that his Greek betrays the foreign late learner. From his father, then, Meleager would inherit his ideals of form, from his mother the emotional intensity of the Semite, the capacity for the heights and depths of feeling, the sensuousness of his nature. Of this eastern sensuousness, passion, mysticism, and characteristic delight in flowers we have a splendid example in the Book of Canticles. Indeed, Professor Nathaniel Schmidt, who is an accomplished classical scholar as well as an outstanding authority on Semitics, mentions the poetry of Meleager as an aid in understanding the spirit of the Book of Canticles⁵³.

Professor Mackail has eloquently expressed his appreciation of the qualities of Meleager. Let me quote some significant sentences from his paragraph on the poet⁵⁴:

We possess about a hundred amatory epigrams by this poet...unequalled in the width of range, the profusion of imagination, the subtlety of emotion with which they sound the whole lyre of passion.... Greek...becomes in his hands almost a new language, full of dreams, at once more languid and more passionate.... In Meleager, the touch of Asiatic blood creates a new type, delicate, exotic, fantastic.... The atmosphere is loaded with a steam of perfumes. With still unimpaired ease and perfection of hand there has come in a strain of that mysticism which represents a relapse or reaction from the Greek spirit. Some of Meleager's epigrams are direct and simple, even to coarseness; but in all the best and most characteristic there is this difference from purely Greek work, that love has become a religion; the spirit of the East has touched them.... Love appears in a hundred shapes amidst a shower of fantastic titles and attributes.... The air all round him is heavy with the scent of flowers⁵⁵ and ointments.... For a moment Meleager can be piercingly simple; and then the fantastic mood comes over him again, and emotion dissolves in a mist of metaphors. But even when he is most fantastic the beauty of his rhythms and grace of his language never fail.

Possibly even Professor Mackail's generous acknowledgment of the oriental element in Meleager is not complete. It may not be too fantastic to suggest

⁴⁵See page 3 of work cited in note 24, above. The passages are Lucian, *Dialogues of the Dead* 25, and *Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum* 3.6399 (Berlin, 1853).

⁴⁶The translation is that of H. W. Fowler and F. G. Fowler, *The Works of Lucian of Samosata*, 3.165 (Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1905).

⁴⁷The outstanding Arabic exponent of this form is Al Hariri. His *maqamat* may be read in the translation by Thomas Chénery, *The Assemblies of Al-Hariri*, Volume I (London, 1867; no more was published). The introduction to this book is especially valuable. Compare also D. S. Margoliouth, in *The Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2.268 (Leyden and London, Luzac and Company, 1927).

⁴⁸F. G. Allinson, *Lucian, Satirist and Artist* (Our Debt to Greece and Rome, New York, Longmans, Green and Company, 1929) discusses Lucian's legacies in literature, on pages 133-187. On pages 121-126 he discusses Lucian's sources, and emphasizes Lucian's independent merits. <For this book see THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 23.115-117. C. K.>.

⁴⁹For Meleager see Christ-Schmid, 326-327, and the books of Mackail and Wright, cited in notes 54 and 56, below.

⁵⁰Greek Anthology 7.417.5-6: "...If I am a Syrian, what wonder? Stranger, we dwell in one country, the world; one Chaos gave birth to all mortals..." (I give the translation by W. R. Paton, in *The Loeb Classical Library*, 2.225).

⁵¹Greek Anthology 7.419.7-8: "...If you are a Syrian, Salam! if you are a Phoenician, Naidius! if you are a Greek, Chaire! (Hail) and say the same yourself". (I quote Paton again: 2.227). <Of Naidius, Mr. Paton says, in a footnote, "This Phoenician word for 'Hail' is uncertain..." C. K.>.

⁵²Ancient Greek Literature, 394 (New York, Appleton, 1897): "...One suspects that, at home in Gadara, Greek was only his second language, and that he had talked Aramaic out of school..."

⁵³See pages viii-ix of the work cited in note 4, above.

⁵⁴J. W. Mackail, *Select Epigrams from the Greek Anthology*, 35-37 (London, Longmans, Green, and Company, 1906).

⁵⁵Bouchier (see page 195 of the work cited in note 6, above) thinks that the preoccupation with flowers is the result of the character of the Syrian landscape, where the inhabitants were "constantly presented with the rapid alternation of dreary wastes and rivers overshadowed with brilliant and luxuriant vegetation..."

that Meleager's exquisite and ecstatic perception of love, the concept of love which is truly romantic, comes only as the reaction of a Greek attitude of enjoyment upon the oriental reverence for chastity, and that we have in Meleager the Hebraism of Matthew Arnold resolved by his Hellenism, the issue of the union of a son of Javan with a daughter of Shem, an issue possible only from such a union. But, whatever explanation be offered for the peculiar qualities of Meleager, or whatever view be taken of the merits of his innovations, it must be clear to any reader of Meleager that he does possess peculiar qualities. The point I wish to make is that Meleager's contribution became part of the tradition of European literature. "He <= Meleager > is the direct inspirer of Propertius and Ovid", says Mr. F. A. Wright⁶⁶, "and from him more than from any other the singers of the early renaissance in France and Italy derive". Professor Postgate⁶⁷ observes that Meleager's influence on Propertius in particular was considerable, and enumerates some ten instances of direct influence⁶⁸. Even in the case of Horace there has been a tendency to revise the earlier view that he drew only from the early Greek lyric poetry, and to point out his indebtedness to his more immediate predecessors among the Greeks, and in particular to some of the poets of the Anthology⁶⁹. Horace too, therefore, may well have learned from Meleager.

Philodemus⁷⁰, my third Gadarene, has quite innocently drawn the ire of classical scholars because he had stocked his⁷¹ library, which was recovered in the ruins of Herculaneum, almost entirely with his own dull philosophical writings instead of with the lyrics of Sappho or even the Menippean satires of Varro. Philodemus's extant works are much greater in extent, his life story much better known, and his influence on Latin authors much more tangible than is the case with his older fellow-townsmen. Philodemus was the domestic philosopher and dependent of L. Calpurnius Piso, the consul of 58 B. C. and subsequently the father-in-law of Julius Caesar. In 55 Cicero delivered against Piso the speech in which he reaches the height of his powers of invective⁷². In the heat of this invective Cicero has some very unkind things to say about

Philodemus⁷³: by precept and example, says Cicero, he had encouraged the dissolute life of his pupil. Even so Cicero admits that Philodemus is a cultured man, that his education and interests far surpass those of the average Epicurean, and that his society verse is both elegant and charming⁷⁴. In the calmer pages of a philosophic essay⁷⁵ Cicero can be much more generous toward Philodemus.

To be sure, we can expect on the part of Cicero no great admiration for an author who in poetry was of the school of Euphorion⁷⁶ and in philosophy a major figure in the Epicurean 'sty'⁷⁷. Cicero's tribute to Philodemus in the *De Finibus* is therefore high praise indeed, and corroborates the very plausible theory that Philodemus is Cicero's chief source for Epicurean doctrine⁷⁸. The first books in both the *De Natura Deorum* and the *De Finibus* record the Epicurean views on the subjects in hand, and scholars have supposed that each was based on a treatise of Philodemus⁷⁹. Similarly, there is a strong possibility that the *Ars Poetica* of Horace was largely based on a work of Philodemus⁸⁰.

But the modern reader will find the epigrams of Philodemus immeasurably more appealing than his philosophic writings, and his influence on Latin poetry, consequently, more interesting than his influence on Latin philosophy. It is always somewhat difficult, at first, to associate the author of the desiccated philosophic treatises with the passionate and frequently coarse epigrams. Possibly Philodemus wrote his farewell to frivolity in good earnest⁸¹:

I was in love once; who has not been? I have revelled; who is uninitiated in revels? nay, I was mad; at whose prompting but a god's? Let them go; for now the silver hair is fast replacing the black, a messenger of wisdom that comes with age. We too played when the time of playing was; and now that it is no longer, we will turn to worthier thoughts.

Perhaps the coarser of his epigrams were written against his better nature to please powerful Roman friends; Mahaffy⁸² has shrewdly suggested that these "epigrams were composed to suit the taste of Roman libertines, perhaps even with disgust and contempt, by

⁶⁶In *Pisonem* 68-72; the entire passage must be read carefully. Cicero does not mention Philodemus by name, but there can be no question that Asconius (Volume 5, Part 2, page 16, in Orelli's edition of Cicero, Zürich, 1833) is right in saying, *Philodemum significat, qui fuit Epicureus illa aetate nobilissimus, cuius et poemata sunt lascivia*.

⁶⁷Compare 70: *Est autem hic de quo loquor non philosophia solum, sed etiam ceteris studiis quae fere ceteros Epicureos negligere dicunt perpolitus. Poema porro facit ita festivum, ita concinnum, ita elegans nihil ut fieri possit argutius.*

⁶⁸*De Finibus* 2.119: *Familiares nostros, credo, Sironem dicis et Philodemum, cum optimos viros, tum homines doctissimos.*

⁶⁹Compare *Tusculanae Disputationes* 3.66: *O poetam egregium <Ennius>, quamquam ab his cantoribus Euphorionis contemnuntur.*

⁷⁰Compare In *Pisonem* 37: *... Epicure noster, ex hara producte, non ex schola.*

⁷¹So, for example, J. B. Mayor, *Ciceronis De Natura Deorum Libri Tres*, 1. xxxiii (Cambridge: At the University Press, 1880). On pages xlii-liv Mayor deals with Cicero's obligations to Philodemus in the first book of his *De Natura Deorum*.

⁷²Schanz-Hosius (as cited in note 29, above) indicate the abundant literature on Cicero's obligations to Philodemus; see, with regard to *De Finibus*, page 506, with regard to *De Natura Deorum*, page 511.

⁷³Kiessling-Heinze's notes on verses 130, 310, 357, 449, in their fourth edition of the *Epistles of Horace* (Berlin, Weidmann, 1914), indicate the influence of Philodemus on Horace. Compare Christian Jensen, *Philodemus Ueber die Gedichte Fünftes Buch*, 93-127 (Berlin, Weidmann, 1923).

⁷⁴Greek Anthology 5.112. I give the translation by J. W. MacKail on page 262 of the work cited in note 54, above.

⁷⁵J. P. Mahaffy, *The Greek World under Roman Sway*, 378, note (London and New York, Macmillan, 1890). On pages 126-130 Mahaffy gives a good account of Philodemus.

⁶⁶F. A. Wright, *The Poets of the Greek Anthology*, 123 (London, George Routledge and Sons, Undated). Mr. Wright also emphasizes the bi-ethnic element in Meleager's poetry.

⁶⁷J. P. Postgate, *Select Elegies of Propertius*, cxxxvii-cxxxviii, and Index, s. v. Meleager (London, Macmillan and Company, 1884).

⁶⁸Further literature on the subject is listed in Schanz (as cited in note 34, above), 260.

⁶⁹See Richard Reitzenstein, *Horaz und die Hellenistische Lyrik*, *Neue Jahrbücher für das Klassische Altertum*, etc., 21 (1908), 81-102.

⁷⁰For Philodemus see Christ-Schmid (as cited in note 14, above), 371-374. To the bibliography there given there must be added a reference to an excellent American work, Harry M. Hubbell, *The Rhetorica of Philodemus*, Translation and Commentary, in the *Transactions of the Connecticut Academy of Arts and Sciences* 23 (1920), 243-382 <see THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 15.88. C. K.>. Interesting notes on the life of Philodemus are to be found in C. Cichorius (as cited in note 29, above), 295-298.

⁷¹Maintained to be his by Domenico Comparetti and Giulio de Petra in their sumptuous folio volume, *La Villa Ercolanese dei Pisoni, i suoi Monumenti e la sua Biblioteca* (Turin, 1883). A more accessible treatment of Piso's villa and the attached library is to be found in Ethel R. Barker, *Buried Herculaneum* (London, A. and C. Black, 1908). Philodemus is discussed on pages 81-91 and 108-120 of this work.

⁷²See J. Wight Duff, *A Literary History of Rome to the Close of the Golden Age*, 357, and 374, note 2 (London, Fisher Unwin, 1911).

the dependent philosopher". Like another newcomer to Rome who wrote to please the smart set Philodemus might have said, *Lasciva est nobis pagina, vita proba est*⁷³.

That the Romans liked Philodemus's type of poetry there can be no doubt, for they paid him the sincere compliment of imitating him. Catullus and Horace, Ovid and Martial have definite echoes of the extant poems of Philodemus⁷⁴. Together with Meleager he was the model for the erotic verse which was so popular at Rome⁷⁵; because he is more vigorous and concise than Meleager Philodemus was in greater favor as a pattern. Impressive as is the cumulative effect of the bits of evidence collected by various scholars to connect the Latin poets with Philodemus, more impressive still is a fragment of Philodemus's treatise *On Flattery* in which Professor Alfred Körte⁷⁶ has deciphered the names of Quintilius and Varius with certainty, and those of Vergil and Horace with great probability, all in the vocative case. Competent scholars have taken this fragment to indicate that Philodemus was actually the teacher of the great Augustans⁷⁷. In a very real sense, therefore, Philodemus would be what Professor Körte has called him, in another connection⁷⁸, "the bridge from the Hellenistic world to the Roman". There were others besides Philodemus who served the important function of acting as bridge between East and West; we have noticed two others born in the same town, near the shores of the Lake of Tiberias. Perhaps, if the full truth were known, we should be inclined to assign to the men from the eastern end of the Mediterranean a greater share in the development of the civilization which spread from the western end.

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

MOSES HADAS

CYRUS THE GREAT AND ABRAHAM LINCOLN ON CHANGING HORSES

In a speech of encouragement to his soldiers just before the battle of Thymbrara Cyrus the Great said¹: "... When the race is on, it is not the time for any chariot to change horses. . ."

Abraham Lincoln likewise thought an emergency was not the time to change horses. His "remark that it is never best to swap horses in crossing a stream" was a strong argument for his renomination to the

⁷³Martial 1.5.8.

⁷⁴Literature on the subject is to be found in Schanz (as cited in note 34, above), 274, 402. Parallels to Philodemus in Catullus, Horace, and Ovid are discussed by K. P. Schulze in the *Berliner Philologische Wochenschrift* 36 (1916), 285-288, 317-320; parallels in Martial by K. Prinz, *Wiener Studien* 34 (1912), 227-236. Compare also G. L. Hendrickson, *Philodemus and Two Latin Congeners*, *The American Journal of Philology* 30 (1918), 27-43. Parallels are also pointed out in G. Kaibel, *Philodemus Gadarensis Epigrammata* (Greifswald, 1885), but this book is now not available to me for examination.

⁷⁵Richard Reitzenstein, in the article *Epigramm*, in *Pauly-Wissowa*, 6.71-111, especially 104; in 98 several specific parallels are cited.

⁷⁶Augusteier bei Philodem, *Rheinisches Museum* 45 (1890), 172-177.

⁷⁷So Hendrickson, for example, in the article cited in note 74, above, and so, very definitely, Christ-Schmid, 371.

⁷⁸Hellenistic Poetry, 401 (translated by J. Hammer and M. Hadas, New York, Columbia University Press, 1929). <For this work see *THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY* 24.183-184. C. K.>

¹Xenophon, *Cyropaedia* 6.3.21. The translation is that of Professor Walter Miller, in *The Loeb Classical Library* (1914. See 2.185).

Presidency². When a delegation from the National Union League came to pay its respects to him after his renomination, he said in his brief response³:

I do not allow myself to suppose that either the convention or the League have concluded that I am either the greatest or the best man in America; but, rather they have concluded that it is not best to swap horses while crossing the river, and have further concluded that I am not so poor a horse, but that they might make a botch of it in trying to swap.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

EUGENE S. MCCARTNEY

THE COURSE OF THE SUN AS A MEASURE- MENT OF EMPIRES

An idea of the vast extent of England's possessions is sometimes vividly conveyed by the statement that the sun never sets on the British Empire. This picturesque saying is not without counterparts in antiquity. As Xerxes was about to lead his hosts against Athens, he boasted that the sun would shine upon no lands bordering upon the Persian Empire¹.

Parallels may be found farther afield. A letter addressed to King Esarhaddon says: "Now, O King my lord, from the rising of the sun to its setting, Ashur has given you dominion"². The dominion of Ashurbanipal is similarly described: "From the rising of the sun unto its setting, he has caused the land to submit under the feet of the king my lord"³.

Even the extent of the kingdom of the Lord of Hosts is represented by similar words:

From the rising of the sun unto the going down of the same the Lord's name is to be praised⁴.

For, from the rising of the sun even unto the going down of the same, my name shall be great among the Gentiles. . .⁵

The mighty God, even the Lord, hath spoken, and called the earth from the rising of the sun unto the going down thereof⁶.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

EUGENE S. MCCARTNEY

ON FOREGOING SALT IN FOOD

In the *Odyssey* 11.119-123 the ghost of Teiresias tells Odysseus that after killing the suitors in his home in Ithaca he is to travel until he comes to the land of a people who know not the sea and who do not use salt in their food.

That it is possible to forego the use of salt in food is shown by a passage in W. H. Prescott's *History of the Conquest of Mexico*¹. This work tells how the Tlascalans, shut off from the coast by hostile Aztec armies,

¹Ida M. Tarbell, *The Life of Abraham Lincoln*, 2.192 (New York, McClure, Phillips and Co., 1902).

²J. B. McClure, *Abraham Lincoln's Stories and Speeches*, 152 (Chicago, Rhodes and McClure Publishing Co., 1906). This story is recorded, with a few unimportant verbal differences, by Anthony Gross, *Lincoln's Own Stories*, 128-129 (New York and London, Harper and Brothers, 1912).

³Herodotus 7.8.3. I have some recollection of having seen this parallel noted in one of the classical journals, but protracted search has failed to locate it.

⁴Leroy Waterman, *Royal Correspondence of the Assyrian Empire*, Humanistic Series, University of Michigan, Volumes 17-19 (University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor, Michigan), Letter 870.

⁵*Ibidem*, Letter 992. ⁶Malachi 1.11. ⁷Psalms 113.3.

⁸Psalms 50.1.

⁹See 1. 418 = Book 3, Chapter 2 (New York, Harper and Brothers, 1853).

had to subsist on products of their own soil and manufacture.

For more than half a century they had neither cotton, nor cacao, nor salt. Indeed, their taste had been so far affected by long abstinence from these articles, that it required the lapse of several generations after the Conquest, to reconcile them to the use of salt at their meals.

Less resolute than the Tlascalans were the Salassi and other hardy mountaineers of antiquity. For two years they held out against Vetus, one of the generals of Augustus, but finally surrendered for want of salt².

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

EUGENE S. MCCARTNEY

A POSSIBLE LITERARY ECHO OF HOMER IN OVID

According to Ovid, *Metamorphoses* 2.327-328, the inscription on the tomb of the ambitious but ill-fated Phaethon ran as follows:

Hic situs est Phaethon, currus auriga paterni;
quem si non tenuit, magnis tamen excidit ausis.

The last four words bear a close resemblance to part of the dying speech of Hector, as given in *Iliad* 22.304-305:

μή μὲν ἀσπιδὶ γε καὶ ἀκλειῶς ἀπολοίμην,
ἀλλὰ μέγα ῥέξας τι καὶ ἱσσομένοισι πυθέσθαι.

The similarity may be merely fortuitous, but Polybius says (5.38.10) that these words of Hector are wont to occur to men of dauntless spirit. Since the lines are quotable and were well known, it is not impossible that Ovid adapted them to his needs.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

EUGENE S. MCCARTNEY

LATIN PARALLELS TO 'AND WHICH' WITH NO PRECEDING 'WHICH'

In *A Comprehensive Guide to Good English* (41)¹, by G. P. Krapp, there appears the following statement:

and which, according to the most careful custom, <is> to be used only after one or more preceding clauses beginning with *which*; if the clause is the first or the only one in the sentence, the *and* should be omitted.

The rule is stated thus in *The Century Handbook of Writing*², Article 17:

Use *and which* (or *but which*), and *who* (or *but who*) only between relative clauses similar in form. Between a main clause and a relative clause, *and* or *but* thwarts subordination.

H. W. Fowler, however, in *A Dictionary of Modern English Usage*, 718³, holds that such a rule is wrong and that the test of correctness is the presence of "a clause or expression of the same grammatical value as the coming *which*-clause. . ." He adds that an equivalent may be "an adjective or participle with its belongings. . .", and refers to an example from Edmund Burke, which I give more fully: ". . . these are things utterly unknown to the laws of this land, and which

arise from a fundamental mistake of the whole order and tenor of our Constitution".

VERGIL'S EIGHTH ECLOGUE: A NEW ENGLAND PARALLEL

An often quoted parallel to certain lines of the second half of Vergil's Eighth Eclogue is found in Rosetti's *Sister Helen*, though the deadly purpose with which Sister Helen melts her "waxen man" is not that of the woman of the eclogue, who chants her rhyming charm as she melts her wax to draw Daphnis home (80-81):

Limus ut hic durescit, et haec ut cera liquescit,
uno eodemque igni, sic nostro Daphnis amore.

A parallel perhaps less familiar may be found in *Authors and Friends*, by Mrs. James T. Fields, 300 in the chapter on Whittier (Houghton Mifflin Company, 1924):

In speaking of Rossetti and of his ballad of "Sister Helen" he confessed to being strangely attracted to this poem because he could remember seeing his mother, "who was as good a woman as ever lived," and his aunt performing the same strange act of melting a waxen figure of a clergyman of their time.

A footnote to the passage states that Mr. Rickard, the biographer of the poet, believes that there is some mistake about this, and suggests "that the story of the waxen image was one told by Whittier's mother of a happening in another family, possibly of something she herself had witnessed. . ." The biographer then acquits the Quaker poet's mother of meddling with witch-work, but the parallel remains.

MACMURRAY COLLEGE,
JACKSONVILLE, ILLINOIS

MARY JOHNSTON

VITAMINES

Even though the Romans never heard of *vitamines*, they understood the importance of fresh vegetables in the diet, and used green vegetables freely. Lettuce (*lactuca*) was well known. Pliny the Elder describes three kinds. He pays tribute to lettuce as an article for the summer bill of fare, saying (19.127), *Est quid m natura omnibus refrigeratrix et ideo aestate gratia. Stomacho fastidium auferunt cibique adpetentiam faciunt. Its medicinal value was celebrated after Augustus recovered from an illness through its use, as Pliny goes on to say (128): Divus certe Augustus lactuca conservatus in aegritudine fertur prudentia Musae medici, cum prioris C. Aemili religio nimia cum necaret, in tantum recepta commendatione ut servari etiam in alienos menses eas oxymeli tum repertum sit. At least nowadays, with modern facilities for transportation and cold storage, we need not preserve it as a sweet pickle (*oxymeli*) for use when out of season. But it is to this cure of Augustus that Columella is said to refer in 10.179-180:*

iamque salutari properet lactuca sapore,
tristia quae relevat longi fastidia morbi.

Similarly, a generation earlier, Catullus had paid tribute to the healing power of nettles (*urtica*) when

¹Appian, *Romana Historia* 10.4.17.

²New York, Rand McNally and Company (1927).

³By G. Greever and E. S. Jones, Revised Edition (New York, The Century Co., 1924).

⁴Oxford: At the Clarendon Press, 1926.

he told his farm, *seu Sabine sive verius Tiburs* (44.1), in 13-15.

Hic me gravido frigida et frequens tussis
quassavit usque dum in tuum sinum fugi
et me recuravi otioque et urtica.

It is interesting, then, to note that results of certain modern studies in the relation of diet to health are reported to tend to show that deficiency of 'Vitamine A' in the diet produces symptoms similar to those of the 'common cold'. Lettuce and other familiar green vegetables are listed among the foods supplying this vitamine. The nettle is not included in any of our lists, nor is it, so far as I know, used for food in this country. It would be interesting to know its dietary value.

MACMURRAY COLLEGE,
JACKSONVILLE, ILLINOIS

MARY JOHNSTON

CANNAE AND TANNENBERG

In an article entitled *The Classical Element in the German War Plan of 1914* (THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 18 [1925], 142-144), Colonel Oliver L. Spaulding, Jr., of the United States Army, maintained that Hannibal's tactics at Cannae exerted a strong influence upon German military strategy before and during the World War. "...Cannae", he says (143), "became the watchword of the German army of 1914". Specifically at the battle of Tannenberg, in East Prussia, in the summer of 1914 Hindenburg's, he says (144), "operations against Samsonoff were a repetition of Cannae on a large scale and with success as complete as Hannibal's. A recent German writer has said that if Schlieffen¹ were to rewrite his studies to-day he would call them Tannenberg, not Cannae..." In a later article, *Warfare, Ancient and Modern* (THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 19 [1925], 3-10), Colonel Spaulding repeats (9) his opinion concerning German indebtedness to Hannibal's maneuvers at Cannae: "...Hindenburg's Battle of Tannenberg was a Cannae on a grand strategic scale..."

Similarly, Professor Bruno Meinecke, in his article *A Modern Cannae* (THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 18 [1925], 157-159), finds the same direct relationship between Hannibal's Cannae and Tannenberg. On page 158 he says: "As a parallel in military tactics no more striking example can be found than that afforded in a comparison between the Battle of Cannae and the Battle of Tannenberg.... In 1914, Hindenburg well-nigh annihilated a Russian army at Tannenberg by applying the principle originated by the great Carthaginian".

A divergent point of view is presented by an English writer, Captain B. H. Liddell Hart, military editor of the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*. Captain Hart served with distinction in the British army during the World War, being then in his early twenties. Since the war he has gained great prominence abroad as a searching and authoritative critic of modern military operations and methods. He is best known to classical scholars for his study of Scipio the Elder, in his book, *A Greater Than Napoleon: Scipio Africanus* (Boston, Little, Brown, and Company, 1927)². In a more recent work entitled *The Real War, 1914-1918* (Boston, Little, Brown, and Company, 1930), Captain Hart devotes a special section (103-114) to Tannenberg, which he terms "The Field of Legend". One legend which he seeks to dissipate (103) is the "romantic picture of an old general <Hindenburg> who, as the hobby of his years of retirement, spent his time in devising a gigantic trap for a future Russian invasion, ... and then, when war came, carrying his dream to

fulfillment..." Behind Hindenburg stands the figure of Ludendorff, Hindenburg's Chief of Staff, and the guiding genius of Ludendorff against the Russians in 1914 was a humbler staff officer, Lieutenant-Colonel Hoffmann, who, according to Captain Hart, "perhaps approached nearer to military genius than any other general of the war" (369). The plan of the German campaign that culminated in Tannenberg had been framed by Colonel Hoffmann, and its "calculated daring" was due in large measure to an earlier experience of his while he was acting as military observer with the Japanese forces in the Russo-Japanese War. There he had learned of the personal antagonism existing between the Russian generals Samsonov and Rennenkampf, and could conclude that neither would be very zealous in hurrying to the aid of the other when circumstances demanded it. The sequel in the summer of 1914 justified his anticipations and his calculations. Samsonov's Russian army on the south, forming the Russian left wing, was crushed by Hindenburg's massed attack in the difficult terrain near Tannenberg, while Rennenkampf was held at bay farther north. Thus the second legend hovering about Tannenberg, that it was "a masterly plan for a second Cannae conceived and dictated in the train that was carrying Ludendorff to pick up his nominal master *en route* to East Prussia" (103), must also be discounted. For "the battle of Tannenberg was not a second Cannae, deliberately planned, as it has so often been claimed. The aim was to break the force of the Russian invasion, and not to surround the Russian army, and the idea of the double envelopment only an afterthought, which became possible of fulfillment when Rennenkampf continued to remain passive" (114). The similarity to Cannae was incidental rather than premeditated.

In a later stage of the World War Captain Hart finds a clearer image of Cannae. During the Second Battle of the Marne, in July, 1918, the employment of the principle of 'elastic defence' by the French Fourth Army east of Reims—the so-called 'Gouraud's manoeuvre' for which General Petain deserves the credit—brought into play a basic idea which "can be traced back another two thousand years—to Cannae, where Hannibal applied it against the Romans in a distinctly more subtle and decisive way" (421).

WESLEYAN UNIVERSITY,
MIDDLETOWN, CONNECTICUT

JOHN W. SPAETH, JR.

AMERICAN ACADEMY IN ROME FELLOWSHIPS

Three fellowships in Classical Studies, each for a term of two years, are to be awarded by the American Academy in Rome. Each Fellow will receive free tuition and residence at the Academy in Rome, and a stipend of \$1,500 a year, with an additional allowance of \$250 a year to cover expenses of transportation to and from Rome. Opportunity is offered for extensive travel, including a trip to Greece. The competitions are open to unmarried citizens of the United States who are not over thirty years of age.

Persons who desire to compete for one of these Fellowships must fill out a formal application and file it with the Executive Secretary not later than *February 1st, 1932*. They must submit evidence of attainment in Latin literature, Greek literature, Greek and Roman history and archaeology, and also of ability to use German and French. A knowledge of Italian is strongly recommended.

Candidates will be required without fail to present published or unpublished papers so as to indicate their fitness to undertake special work in Rome.

For detailed circular and application blank apply to Roscoe Guernsey, Executive Secretary of the American Academy in Rome, 101 Park Avenue, New York City.

ROSCE GUERNSEY

¹Count Alfred von Schlieffen, Chief of the General Staff of the German army from 1891 to 1907.

²This book was reviewed by Professor Jacob Hammer, in THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY 22 (1929), 127-128.

The New York Classical Club

Thirty-second Year 1931-1932

LUNCHEON MEETINGS

November 7, at 10:30 A. M.—Business Meeting, Address, Luncheon.

Subject—The Appeal of Horace.

Speaker—Professor Herbert C. Lipscomb, Randolph-Macon Woman's College, Lynchburg, Virginia.

Place—Room 305, Schermerhorn Hall, Columbia University.

Luncheon—Men's Faculty Club, Morningside Drive and 117th Street.

February 27, at 10:30 A.M.—Business Meeting, Address, Luncheon.

Subject—Lyric Seneca.

Speaker—Professor Clarence W. Mendell, Yale University.

Place—Casa Italiana. Luncheon—Men's Faculty Club.

May 9, at 10:30 A. M.—Business Meeting, Address, Luncheon.

Subject—Cicero and the Academy.

Speaker—Professor Nelson Glenn McCrea, Columbia University.

Place—Casa Italiana. Luncheon—Men's Faculty Club.

FORUM MEETINGS

December 5, at 10:30 A. M.

Topic—What Human Interest or Romantic Stories Suitable for Beginners Can be Found in Latin Authors?

Place—Students' Hall, Barnard College.

March 19, at 10:30 A. M.

Topic—What Can be Done to Encourage the Study of Greek?

Chairman, Dr. Charles A. Tonsor, Grover Cleveland High School, Brooklyn.

Note: Annual dues—\$1.00, payable May 1.

Luncheon Tickets—\$1.25 each; Season (3), \$3.50.

Tickets may be obtained from the Secretary-Treasurer.

Professor E. Adelaide Hahn Hunter College

Please notify Secretary of any change in name or address.

VIRGIL AND THOSE OTHERS

By

HOMER F. REBERT

"A BOOK for those who love and teach the classics as literature. . . . The spirit of these sprightly little appreciations of Vergil, Catullus, Horace, and Juvenal can be inferred from the following lines of the preface: 'This volume is devoted to the thesis that the Latin classics must be looked upon as literature, as a form of artistic expression, if the full educational and cultural values are to be realized from their pursuit' ".—*The Classical Bulletin*.

"<The essays> are each and all worth reading, especially if one cares to see how painstaking, detailed, and concrete literary criticism becomes when practiced by a trained classical scholar".—Professor G. M. Whicher, in *New York Herald Tribune*.

"Only the responsiveness of a true musician could produce the three essays: 'Symphony of Love: A Study in Symmetry', 'Odduna: A Dramatic Monologue', and 'Barine's Portrait' ".—C. L. Sherman, in *Amherst Graduates' Quarterly*.

Price \$2.00

VIRGIL BIMILLENNIUM COMMITTEE OF
AMHERST COLLEGE

AMHERST, MASS.

The Classical Association of the Atlantic States

OFFICERS 1931-1932

President: Mr. Joseph P. Behm, Department of Education, Syracuse, New York
Secretary-Treasurer: Professor Charles Knapp, Barnard College, Columbia University

Vice-Presidents:

Miss Elsie I. Barrows, Central High School, Syracuse, New York
Dr. I. W. Drabkin, Townsend Harris Hall, The College of the City of New York, New York City
Miss Martha Elting, Battin High School, Elizabeth, New Jersey
Professor Horace W. Wright, Lehigh University, Bethlehem, Pennsylvania
Professor Robert E. Dengler, State College, Pennsylvania
Mr. Alvin Wakeland, Newark, Delaware
Professor James P. Templeman, Baltimore City College, Baltimore, Maryland
Mrs. Ada H. Coe, McKinley High School, Washington, D. C.

These Officers, with the President for the year 1930-1931, Professor Charles S. Smith, The George Washington University, Washington, D. C., constitute the Executive Committee.

SUMMER SESSION

American School of Classical Studies
at Athens

July 4-August 14, 1932

A careful study of the sites in Attica. Visits to the important places of interest in Northern Greece and Peloponnesus including Delphi, Thebes, Thermopylae, Eretria, Eleusis, Corinth, Argos, Mycenae, Tiryns, Epidaurus, Bassae, Messene, Tegea, Megalopolis, Sparta, Olympia.

The new residence building, Loring Hall, will be open to students.

The cost, last summer, was as low as \$500 in some cases.

It may be necessary to limit the number of students next summer. Early registration is advised.

For further information write the
Director of the Summer Session,

LOUIS E. LORD
172 Oak St., Oberlin, O.

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

Is published by The Classical Association of the Atlantic States (New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Maryland, Delaware, and District of Columbia).

Editors: Managing Editor, Charles Knapp, Barnard College, Columbia University; Associate Editors, George Dwight Kellogg, Union College, Walton B. McDaniel, University of Pennsylvania, David M. Robinson, The Johns Hopkins University, Evan T. Sage, University of Pittsburgh.

Place of Publication.—Barnard College, New York City.

Time of Publication.—Mondays, from October 1 to May 31, except weeks in which there is a legal or a School holiday (Election Day, Thanksgiving Day, Christmas Day, New Year's Day, Lincoln's Birthday, Washington's Birthday, Easter Sunday, and Decoration Day).

Terms of Subscription

Outside the territory of the Association the subscription price is Two Dollars Per Volume (for foreign postage, add fifty cents; for affidavit to bill, add one dollar). Single numbers, 15 cents each.

All subscriptions run by the volume.

By the regulations of the Post Office it is entirely proper for a publisher to continue sending a paper for some time (in fact, for a year) after the expiration of a subscription, in the effort to secure continuance of subscription. If a subscriber MUST discontinue, he is requested to send notice BEFORE the beginning of a volume.

Subscription via Membership.—Within the territory of the Association, subscription is by membership. The annual dues (May 1 to April 30) carry subscription for the volume running from October to May following. Membership bestows certain other valuable privileges. Any member wishing to withdraw is requested to signify his intention in writing before May 1 in any year; otherwise he may fairly be considered liable to pay for the entire year beginning on that May 1.

SPECIAL NOTICE.—To replace copies issued before notice is given of change of address, a charge of 15 cents per copy must be made. Claim for a number not received should be made within 20 days of the date of issue of the number; otherwise a charge of 15 cents per copy will be made.

Address all communications

to Charles Knapp, 1737 Sedgwick Avenue, New York City.

Printed by W. F. Humphrey, 300 Pulteney Street, Geneva, N. Y.